

A Newly Discovered Edition of the English *Palmerin d'Oliva*

The Castilian book of chivalry titled *Palmerín de Olivia* was printed for the first time in Salamanca in 1511.¹ This work narrating the life of its eponymous hero appeared in the wake of the successful publication of *Amadís de Gaula*,² and soon its fame crossed the Pyrenees. First, it circulated in Italy, where two editions of the Spanish original were printed in Venice in 1526 and

Research for this piece was funded in part by the Spanish Ministry of Economy and Competitiveness (ref. FFI2015–70101–P), whose support is hereby gratefully acknowledged.

¹ For a description of this edition, see F. J. Norton, *A Descriptive Catalogue of Printing in Spain and Portugal 1501–1520* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1978), no. 496. For a critical edition, see *El libro del famoso e muy esforçado cavallero Palmerín de Olivia*, ed. by Giuseppe di Stefano, in *Studi sul Palmerín de Olivia*, 3 vols, Istituto di Letteratura Spagnola e Hispano-Americana 11–13 (Pisa: Università di Pisa, 1966), I. For a still useful overview of the genre of the Iberian books of chivalry, see Henry Thomas, *Spanish and Portuguese Romances of Chivalry: The Revival of the Romance of Chivalry in the Spanish Peninsula, and its Extension and Influence abroad* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1920), esp. pp. 84–118.

² The earliest extant edition of *Amadís de Gaula*, books I–IV, was printed in Saragossa in 1508, and its continuation, book V, in Seville in 1510; for bibliographical descriptions, see Norton, *Catalogue*, nos 625 and 788, respectively. It seems likely that a previous edition of books I–IV was printed in Seville in 1496, for which see Rafael Ramos, ‘Para la fecha del *Amadís de Gaula*: “Esta sancta guerra que contra los infieles començada tienen” ’, *Boletín de la Real Academia Española*, 74 (1994), 503–21.

1534,³ soon to be followed by an Italian translation published in 1544.⁴ Next, this work was rendered into French by Jean Maugin and made available to readers in an edition first printed in Paris in 1546.⁵ Maugin's version was the primary source used by Anthony Munday to prepare his English translation, printed for the first time by John Charlewood for William Wright in

³ For bibliographical descriptions, see Encarnación García Dini, 'Per una bibliografia dei romanzi di cavalleria: Edizioni del ciclo dei "Palmerines"', in *Studi sul Palmerín de Olivia*, III, 5–44 (pp. 10–14).

⁴ For a description, see Alberto Tinto, *Annali tipografici dei Tramezzino* (Florence: Olschki, 1968), no. 51. The Italian translation was prepared by Mambrino Roseo da Fabriano; for biographical information, see Anna Bognolo, 'Mambrino Roseo da Fabriano: vita provvisoria di uno scrittore', in *Repertorio delle continuazioni italiane ai romanzi cavallereschi spagnoli: Ciclo di 'Amadis di Gaula'*, ed. by Anna Bognolo, Giovanni Cara and Stefano Neri (Rome: Bulzoni, 2013), 25–75. See also Anna Bognolo, 'Los palmerines italianos: una primera aproximación', in *Palmerín y sus libros: 500 años*, ed. by Aurelio González and others (Mexico: El Colegio de México, 2013), 255–84.

⁵ See *French Vernacular Books: Books Published in the French Language before 1601*, ed. by Andrew Pettegree, Malcolm Walsby and Alexander Wilkinson, 2 vols (Leiden: Brill, 2007), II, nos 40395–7. For a discussion of the French *Palmerin d'Olive*, see Alan Freer, 'Palmerín de Olivia in Francia', in *Studi sul Palmerín de Olivia*, III, 177–237; and Anna Bettoni, 'Il Palmerín de Olivia tradotto da Maugin: editori, storie e mode letterarie nella Francia del Cinquecento', in *"Il n'est nul si beau passe temps Que se jouer à sa Pensee". Studi di filologia e letteratura francese in onore di Anna Maria Finoli* (Pisa: ETS, 1995), 173–201. For the printed circulation of the entire *Palmerin* cycle across early modern Europe, see Stefano Neri, 'Cuadro de la difusión europea del ciclo palmeriniano (siglos XVI–XVII)', in *Palmerín y sus libros*, 285–313.

1588.⁶ Unlike all other European versions, the English *Palmerin d'Oliva* was printed in two parts, as two separate volumes that could sell for half the price, thus adapting this literary product to the English book market, where customers below the level of the elite might be more inclined to buy it if made affordable to them. The two parts of Munday's *Palmerin d'Oliva* were reprinted in 1597,⁷ 1615/1616,⁸ and in 1637 for the last time.⁹ Such premature interruption of

⁶ STC 19157. For the publication of this work in English, see Jordi Sánchez-Martí, 'The Publication History of Anthony Munday's *Palmerin d'Oliva*', *Gutenberg-Jahrbuch*, 89 (2014), 190–207. For biographical information on Charlewood, see H. R. Tedder, 'Charlewood, John (*d.* 1593)', rev. Robert Faber, in *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2004), XI, 176–77; for Wright, see R. B. McKerrow, gen. ed., *A Dictionary of Printers and Booksellers in England, Scotland and Ireland, and of Foreign Printers of English Books 1557–1640* (London: The Bibliographical Society, 1910), 303–4. Although Munday translated from the French version, he also consulted a copy of the Italian translation; see Giuseppe Galigani, 'La versione inglese del *Palmerín de Olivia*', in *Studi sul Palmerín de Olivia*, III, 239–88 (pp. 252–54). For a literary discussion of the *Palmerin* cycle and its influence upon English literary culture, see Mary Patchell, *The 'Palmerin' Romances in Elizabethan Prose Fiction*, Columbia University Studies in English and Comparative Literature 166 (New York: Columbia University Press, 1947). For Munday's literary career, see Donna B. Hamilton, *Anthony Munday and the Catholics, 1560–1633* (Aldershot: Ashgate, 2005); and Celeste Turner, *Anthony Munday: An Elizabethan Man of Letters*, University of California Publications in English 2, no. 1 (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1928).

⁷ STC 19158.

⁸ STC 19159 and 19159a. STC 19159a represents a different issue of STC 19159, with a cancel title page of part I dated 1616; for facsimile reproductions of the cancellandum and the

Palmerin d'Oliva's printed circulation in England may be in part due, as I suggested elsewhere, to the severe judgement of the curate in Cervantes's *Don Quixote*, where he states, 'let [*Palmerin d'*] *Oliua* be presently rent in pieces, and burned in such sort, that euen the very ashes thereof may not be found'.¹⁰

Apropos of the edition of *Palmerin d'Oliva*, part I, printed by Thomas Creede in 1615, the STC and ESTC provide different information. According to the STC, the first issue of the 1615 edition is extant only in the copy held at the library of Lambeth Palace,¹¹ whereas ESTC refers to the existence of a different copy in the library of Christ Church, Oxford.¹² In 2012 I contacted Dr Cristina Neagu, Keeper of Special Collections at Christ Church, and inquired about the copy of *Palmerin d'Oliva* purportedly held in their library. I received an email from her confirming that 'according to the ESTC, we were thought to possess a fragment of one leaf', but no record of

cancellans, see Sánchez-Martí, 'The Publication of Munday's *Palmerin*', figs 2–3 (pp. 198, 200).

I will refer to this as the 1615 edition, because part I was indeed printed before the end of 1615, even if a different issue was published with the date 1616; part II was printed in 1616.

⁹ STC 19160. For a bibliographical description, see Jordi Sánchez-Martí, 'The University of Alicante Copy of *Palmerin d'Oliva* (London, 1637): A Bibliographical Description', *Sederi: Yearbook of the Spanish and Portuguese Society for English Renaissance Studies*, 23 (2013), 123–37.

¹⁰ 'The Publication of Munday's *Palmerin*', 205. The quotation is from Thomas Shelton's translation of *Don Quixote* (London, 1612; STC 4915), p. 41.

¹¹ Shelfmark ARC K73.3B P18; in the STC it is listed as the Sion College library.

¹² ESTC no. S927. Accessed 21 October 2018.

such fragment existed. Still, Dr Neagu did not abandon hope that one day it could still be located: ‘We may well have it in a binding and will someday be rediscovered’.¹³

I recently embarked on a research project dealing with the circulation of the Iberian chivalric romances in English translation and asked my research assistant, Mrs Elizabeth Ward, to help me compile a list of all existing copies of editions of Iberian books of chivalry in English translation printed before 1700. In 2017 she got in touch with Christ Church’s library and requested information about the copy of the 1615 edition that, according to the ESTC, is preserved there. David Stump, Antiquarian Cataloguer of Christ Church, informed her in personal communication that fragments from the copy in question had been located and, much to our surprise, he also explained that they belonged to an edition different from the one printed by Creede in 1615. Before the end of 2017 this information was conveyed to the ESTC staff and is now included in their database.¹⁴ The present note briefly describes the fragments of *Palmerin d’Oliva* in the special collections library of Christ Church, now shelfmarked P.163*, identifies the textual sections contained therein, and establishes their relation to the rest of extant editions of Munday’s translation. This detailed examination should enable us conjecturally to ascertain the printer—or printers—who produced this edition and to establish an approximate date of publication too.

INSERT FIGURE 1 HERE

ESTC no. S506036, sig. B8^v. Christ Church, Oxford, P.163*.

Reproduced with kind permission.

The fragments recently discovered comprise not one leaf, as the ESTC informed Dr Neagu (cf. n. 13), but two leaves, which are fragmentarily preserved as endleaves in a copy of volume

¹³ Email message to author, 14 December 2012. Cf. Sánchez-Martí, ‘The Publication of Munday’s *Palmerin*’, 199 n. 40.

¹⁴ ESTC no. S506036.

II of Cicero's *Orationes*, printed by Richard Field in London in 1618 and now held in the same library (shelfmarked P.163).¹⁵ The variously sized fragments contain between 2 and 13 lines of text printed on both sides, although the paper has been cropped at the margins and some letters have been lost as a result (see fig. 1). The sections of text preserved belong to parts of chapters 2, 5 and 6 of *Palmerin d'Oliva*, part I, and correspond to the conjugate leaves 1 and 8 of this edition's signature B. When we visually compare the textual presentation of these fragments with the corresponding sections of the other *Palmerin* editions, it becomes apparent that the Christ Church fragments are markedly different from the 1588 and 1597 editions. The 1615 edition, however, printed by Thomas Creede in partnership with Bernard Alsop, presents the following typographical similarities with the Christ Church's copy: running-titles are printed in capital letters;¹⁶ chapter titles are printed in roman with italic for typographical contrast and are preceded by a paragraph mark; black letter is preferred for the body of the text, with roman for contrast (see fig. 2). In addition, there is perfect line-by-line textual correspondence between the two editions. Hence, it seems safe to conclude that one edition served as copy-text for the other.

INSERT FIGURE 2 HERE

STC 19159a, part I, sig. B8^v. British Library C.56.d.8.

Reproduced with kind permission.

In order to determine which edition preceded the other, I have collated the text of the Christ Church fragments (hereafter designated *CC*) and the editions of *Palmerin d'Oliva* printed in 1588 (designated *1*), 1597 (2) and 1615 (3). Below I list all substantive variants existing among these four editions in the textual sections contained in *CC*, and mention some relevant variations

¹⁵ STC 5310.5. Richard Field was active as a printer in London between 1579 and 1624; see McKerrow, *Dictionary of Printers*, 102–3.

¹⁶ According to the ESTC, the 'running title [in the Christ Church fragments] resembles that found in STC 19159 and 19159a'; see n. 8 above.

in the accidentals too. Since *CC* and 3 present identical line-by-line setting of text, I locate all variants with reference to the signatures and line numbers in 3. The lemmatic reading is that of *I*, while the stemma identifies the variant readings in the three other editions:

B1^r, lines 10–11: discerned.] discovered) 2; discovered, 3, *CC*

B1^r, line 11: But] and 2, 3, *CC*

B1^v, line 16: ought be] ought to be 2, 3, *CC*

B1^v, line 17: that is it I] that is it that I 3, *CC*

B8^r, line 4: went] wente 2, *CC*; got 3

B8^r, line 16: that] which 3

B8^r, line 25: my Ladie] any Ladie 3

B8^r, line 26: thereof] therefore 2, 3, *CC*

B8^r, line 33: verie] very 2, *CC*; *om.* 3

B8^r, line 35: past] ouer-past 3

B8^v, line 28: by] *om.* 3, *CC*

From this collation the following conclusions can be drawn:

- (1) neither 3 nor *CC* used *I* as copy-text, since every time 2 departs from the *editio princeps*, it determines or influences the readings of later editions (e.g. B1^r, lines 11, 16; B8^r, line 26);
- (2) *CC* does not derive genetically from 3, since every time that 3 has unique readings, *CC* agrees with 2, not with 3 (e.g. B8^r, lines 4, 16, 25, 33, 35);
- (3) instead, 3 derives genetically from *CC*, since every time *CC* departs from 2, *CC* and 3 agree, i.e. *CC* determines the reading in 3 (e.g. B1^r, lines 10–11; B1^v, line 17; B8^v, line 28);

(4) therefore, the textual evidence suggests that *CC* must derive from 2.¹⁷

With the bibliographical evidence available to him in 1925, Gerald R. Hayes established that 3 descended from 2.¹⁸ The discovery of the Christ Church fragments sheds new light on the textual derivation of these two editions, confirming that 3 descended from 2 although not directly, but via *CC*. Unfortunately there is no fragment corresponding to *Palmerin d'Oliva*, part II, that could have helped us elucidate this part's more complex textual transmission: we know that part II of 3 derives from *I*, not 2, but it is not clear whether compositors used an intermediate version (*CC*?) or not.¹⁹

According to the ESTC the Christ Church fragments were printed *c.* 1600 by Creede and Alsop. As I will show, the conjectural attribution and date suggested by the ESTC are not without problems and, in fact, need to be corrected. On 9 August 1596 Thomas Creede obtained a licence to print the two parts of *Palmerin d'Oliva*,²⁰ which he did publish in 1597. Creede officially owned this licence until 4 December 1615, when it passed to Richard

¹⁷ According to ESTC, *CC* presents 'A nearly identical setting of text to STC 19158 [i.e., 2]'.

¹⁸ Hayes, 'Anthony Munday's Romances of Chivalry', *The Library*, 4th ser., 6 (1925), 57–81 (p. 75); cf. Sánchez-Martí, 'The Publication of Munday's *Palmerin*', 201–2.

¹⁹ See Hayes, 'Munday's Romances of Chivalry', 76; and Sánchez-Martí, 'The Publication of Munday's *Palmerin*', 202–4.

²⁰ *A Transcript of the Registers of the Company of Stationers of London; 1554–1640 A.D.*, ed. by Edward Arber, 5 vols (London: privately printed, 1875–7; repr. New York: Peter Smith, 1950), III (1876), 68. For information about Creede, see Akihiro Yamada, *Thomas Creede: Printer to Shakespeare and His Contemporaries* (Tokyo: Meisei University Press, 1994); and David L. Gants, 'Creede, Thomas (*b.* in or before 1554, *d.* 1616)', in *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*, XIV, 128–29.

Heggenbotham,²¹ who financed the 1615/1616 edition printed by Creede and Alsop.

Consequently, if between 1596 and 1615 Creede owned the right to print *Palmerin d'Oliva*, it seems reasonable that the edition represented by the Christ Church fragments—from which the 1615 edition is derived—also came off Creede's printing press. The typographic proximity between *CC* and *3* further substantiates this hypothesis.²²

If it is probable that *CC* was printed at some point between 1596 and 1615, we need to determine when it seems likeliest that Creede considered it convenient to issue a new edition of *Palmerin d'Oliva*. Only when the entire print run of the 1597 edition of *Palmerin d'Oliva* was sold out would Creede choose to reprint the same work. Notwithstanding the relative commercial success the Iberian books of chivalry attained in Elizabethan England,²³ it seems improbable that a new edition of Munday's *Palmerin* was called for within three years' time, as the ESTC suggests. A later date seems more plausible. When Creede, on 9 August 1596, was granted a licence to print *Palmerin d'Oliva*, he also registered *Palmerin of England*, another

²¹ *A Transcript of the Registers of the Company of Stationers*, III, 579. For information on Heggenbotham, see McKerrow, *Dictionary of Printers*, 136.

²² See pp. 5–6 above. The typographical similarity possibly explains why the ESTC was initially misled into thinking that *CC* was a copy of the 1615 edition; see p. 4 above. Note that the typographical proximity would exist only for signatures A–F, since the rest of the 1615 edition of part I was printed using a different font of type, probably belonging to Alsop; cf. Sánchez-Martí, 'The Publication of Munday's *Palmerin*', 200–1 and fig. 4 (p. 203).

²³ See my chapter 'The Publication of Chivalric Romances in England, 1570–1603', in *Iberian Chivalric Books in English Translation: Anthony Munday and Early Modern English Culture* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, forthcoming).

Iberian romance belonging to the *Palmerin* cycle.²⁴ Before the end of 1596 Creede put on the market parts I and II of *Palmerin of England*,²⁵ and in the following months did the same with *Palmerin d'Oliva*. Interestingly, these two romances were again printed back to back in 1615 and 1616, but in reversed order, first *Palmerin d'Oliva* and next *Palmerin of England*.²⁶ It may be surmised that Creede's publication of *Palmerin d'Oliva* went hand in hand with his editions of *Palmerin of England*.

Significantly, in 1609 Creede printed another edition of *Palmerin of England*,²⁷ copies of which have survived but of part I alone. Since Creede tended to associate the publication of the two *Palmerin* romances, it would follow that he might have printed another edition of *Palmerin d'Oliva* immediately after or before his 1609 edition of *Palmerin of England*. The Christ Church fragments, therefore, could represent the only existing remnants of the edition of *Palmerin d'Oliva* printed by Creede c. 1609. The extant evidence suggests a pattern of variable but parallel periodicity in the publication of the two main *Palmerin* romances. The publication of the cycle was inaugurated with *Palmerin of England*, which was printed in the following years: c.

²⁴ See n. 20 above. For information on this romance, see William Edward Purser, *Palmerin of England: Some Remarks on this Romance and on the Controversy concerning its Authorship* (Dublin: Browne and Nolan, 1904).

²⁵ STC 19161. For the reprinting of the *Palmerin* romances in 1596–7, see Louise Wilson, 'Playful Paratexts: The Front Matter of Anthony Munday's Iberian Romance Translations', in *Renaissance Paratexts*, ed. by Helen Smith and Louise Wilson (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2011), 121–32 (pp. 126–27).

²⁶ STC 19163.

²⁷ STC 19162.

1581–1585,²⁸ 1596, 1609, 1616 and 1639.²⁹ The next title from the *Palmerin* cycle to appear in print was *Palmerin d’Oliva*, published in 1588 (*I*), 1597 (*2*), c. 1609 (*CC*), 1615–1616 (*3*), and 1637.³⁰

Dating the Christ Church fragments to c. 1609, moreover, is consistent with Creede’s commercial activities, since the years 1607–8 and 1610 saw a marked decline in his overall output.³¹ Creede’s reduced level of productivity perhaps explains that the interval between the publication of *2* and *CC* was of twelve years, as opposed to nine years between *I* and *2*, and six between *CC* and *3*.³² While all extant evidence proves beyond any doubt that Creede was involved in the printing of the Christ Church fragments, can we be so sure that Bernard Alsop—as the ESTC indicates—collaborated in the production of this edition? Alsop’s printing career began at the end of 1615, precisely with his partial publication of *Palmerin d’Oliva* for Creede,

²⁸ On 13 February 1581 Charlewood obtained a licence to print *Palmerin of England*; see *A Transcript of the Registers of the Company of Stationers*, II (1875), 388. While the earliest extant copy of *Palmerin of England* is from the 1596 edition, there is a reference to ‘Palmering [sic], 2 parts’ in a list of books, dated 1585, sold by the London bookseller and printer Thomas Marshe. Since *Palmerin d’Oliva* was not published until 1588, this record in Marshe’s list can only refer to *Palmerin of England*, parts I and II; see Henry R. Plomer, ‘Some Elizabethan Book Sales’, *The Library*, 3rd ser, 7 (1916), 318–29 (p. 328).

²⁹ STC 19164.

³⁰ STC 19160. Notice that although *I* bears the year 1588 on the title page, it was published on New Year’s Day and, hence, the edition must have been prepared towards the end of 1587.

³¹ See Yamada, *Thomas Creede*, 8.

³² This reduction to six years is certainly attributable to his shared printing with Alsop and the financial involvement of the bookseller Heggenbotham.

and hence he could not have been involved as a printer in printing an edition that was certainly produced before 1615.³³ In addition, as Creede was used to working on his own,³⁴ it seems safe that we consider him the only printer of the edition of c. 1609. To conclude, the fragments in Christ Church, Oxford, shelfmarked P.163*, correspond to the conjugate signatures B1 and B8 of a copy of the edition of *Palmerin d'Oliva*, part I, printed by Thomas Creede in London c. 1609. From a textual point of view, this edition is descended from the one Creede printed in 1597 and served as copy-text for the 1615 edition, produced by Creede in association with Alsop.

INSERT FIGURE 3 HERE

ESTC no. S506036, sig. B8^r. Christ Church, Oxford, P.163*.

Reproduced with kind permission.

The Christ Church fragments contain another piece of evidence that has some historical interest, namely, what appears to be Henry Aldrich's handwriting practice (see fig. 3). In 1660 Aldrich became 'a pleasant, sociable Dean of Christ Church', as his biographer describes him.³⁵

³³ For information on Alsop, see Henry R. Plomer, *A Dictionary of the Booksellers and Printers who were at Work in England, Scotland and Ireland from 1641 to 1667* (London: The Bibliographical Society, 1907), 3–4. Actually, printers' dictionaries date the beginning of his career to 1616, but the first printing job we can associate him with was the 1615 edition of *Palmerin d'Oliva*; cf. Sánchez-Martí, 'The Publication of Munday's *Palmerin*', p. 201 n. 42. Note that Alsop was made free of the Stationers' Company on 7 February 1610; see *A Transcript of the Registers of the Company of Stationers*, III, 683.

³⁴ Throughout his entire career as a printer Creede shared the production of only 9 per cent of the editions he printed; see Yamada, *Thomas Creede*, 45.

³⁵ W. G. Hiscock, *Henry Aldrich of Christ Church, 1648–1710* (Oxford: Christ Church, 1960), 1. See also Stuart Handley, 'Aldrich, Henry (1648–1710)', in *Oxford Dictionary of National*

It is unlikely that Aldrich practised his handwriting using a book from the college library, but would have done so on a book from his personal collection, which was partly based on the library built up by Christopher Hatton, first Baron Hatton, that he received around 1670.³⁶ On Aldrich's death in 1710, his personal library comprised some 3,000 books and pamphlets, which he bequeathed to Christ Church, including his copy of volume II of Cicero's *Orationes*, where the conjugate signatures B1 and B8 of *Palmerin d'Oliva*, part I, are used as endleaves.³⁷

Biography, I, 630–33; and E. F. A. Suttle, 'Henry Aldrich, Dean of Chirst Church', *Oxoniensia*, 5 (1940), 115–39.

³⁶ Handley, 'Aldrich', 630. See also Victor Stater, 'Hatton, Christopher, first Baron Hatton (*bap.* 1605, *d.* 1670)', in *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*, XXV, 823–24.

³⁷ See Hiscock, *Henry Aldrich*, 4; and Handley, 'Aldrich', 633.